



ADMINISTRATIVE/ PERSONNEL COMMITTEE AGENDA

**TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 14, 2021
11:00 a.m.**

Pursuant to Governor Newsom's Executive Order N-29-20 (March 18, 2020), the Administrative/Personnel Committee meeting will only be conducted via video/teleconferencing.

INSTRUCTIONS FOR ELECTRONIC PARTICIPATION

Join Zoom Meeting

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/87073073903?pwd=cnhuNHV3K05xZmM2dWRhb2EzelhsUT09>

Meeting ID: 870 7307 3903

Passcode: 294524

One Tap Mobile

+16699009128,,87073073903# US (San Jose)

Dial by Location

+1 669 900 9128 US (San Jose)

Meeting ID: 870 7307 3903

IF YOU ARE UNABLE TO CONNECT VIA DIAL IN OPTION, PLEASE CALL 760-346-1127.

Public comment is encouraged to be emailed to the Administrative/Personnel Committee prior to the meeting at cvag@cvag.org by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the committee meeting. Comments intended to be read aloud should be no more than 300 characters.

**THIS MEETING IS HANDICAPPED ACCESSIBLE.
ACTION MAY RESULT ON ANY ITEMS ON THIS AGENDA**

1. **CALL TO ORDER** – Chair Christy Holstege, City of Palm Springs

2. **ROLL CALL**

A. **Member Roster**

P4

3. **PUBLIC COMMENTS ON AGENDA ITEMS**

This is the time and place for members of the public to address the Administrative/Personnel Committee on agenda items. At the discretion of the Chair, comments may be taken at the time items are presented. Please limit comments to three (3) minutes.

4. **CHAIR / EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ANNOUNCEMENTS**

5. **CONSENT CALENDAR**

A. **Approval of the April 19, 2021 Administrative/Personnel Committee Minutes**

P5

B. **Approve Resolution No. 21-006 authorizing the use of Department of Justice fingerprinting for employment in the CV Housing First program**

P9

6. **DISCUSSION**

A. **Virtual Committee Meetings at CVAG – Joanna Stueckle**

P11

Recommendation: Authorize the Chair and/or the Executive Director to advocate for Brown Act changes to allow regional agencies to continue utilizing virtual meetings, and continue to utilize virtual meetings consistent with state law and guidelines

B. **Review of CVAG Personnel Classifications and Compensation Structure–
Claude T. Kilgore**

P18

Recommendation: Authorize the Executive Director to release a request for proposals for professional services related to assessing CVAG's current personnel classifications and compensation structure

C. **Executive Director Performance Evaluation Procedure – Erica Felci**

P20

Recommendation: Implement an annual performance review process for the Executive Director by the Administrative/ Personnel Committee

7. **PUBLIC COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

This is the time and place for members of the public to address the Administrative/Personnel Committee on items of general interest within the purview of this committee. Please limit comments to two (2) minutes.

8. **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Upcoming Meetings:

The next meeting of the **Executive Committee** will be held on Monday, September 27, 2021, at 4:30 p.m. via Zoom webinar.

ITEM 2A

**ADMINISTRATIVE/PERSONNEL
COMMITTEE
ROSTER**



Jurisdiction	Seat on Committee	Members
City of Palm Springs	CVAG Chair	Christy Holstege Mayor
City of Coachella	Chair Vice Chair	Steven Hernandez Mayor
City of Desert Hot Springs	Chair Appointee	Scott Matas Mayor
Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians	Chair Appointee	Jeff Grubbe Tribal Chairman
City of Indio	CVAG Past Chair	Glenn Miller Councilmember
City of La Quinta	CVCC Chair	Linda Evans Mayor

ITEM 5A

**ADMINISTRATIVE/ PERSONNEL COMMITTEE
MINUTES OF MEETING
APRIL 19, 2021**



1. CALL TO ORDER

The April 19, 2021 Administrative/Personnel Committee meeting was called to order at 9:01 a.m. by Chair Glenn Miller, City of Indio, via Zoom, which was pursuant to Gov. Newsom’s executive order governing how meetings are held during the COVID-19 pandemic.

2. ROLL CALL

MEMBERS PRESENT

Councilmember Glenn Miller, Chair
Mayor Christy Holstege, Vice Chair
Mayor Steven Hernandez
Tribal Chair Jeff Grubbe, Past Chair
Mayor Linda Evans, CVCC Chair

AGENCY

City of Indio
City of Palm Springs
City of Coachella
Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians
City of La Quinta

MEMBERS ABSENT

Mayor Scott Matas

AGENCY

City of Desert Hot Springs

STAFF PRESENT

Tom Kirk
Claude T. Kilgore
Joanna Stueckle

3. PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

4. CHAIR / EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ANNOUNCEMENTS

None.

5. CONSENT CALENDAR

IT WAS MOVED BY MAYOR EVANS AND SECONDED BY MAYOR HOLSTEGE TO APPROVE THE REVISED MARCH 30, 2021 ADMINISTRATIVE/PERSONNEL COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES.

THE MOTION CARRIED WITH 5 AYES AND 1 MEMBER ABSENT.

COUNCILMEMBER MILLER	AYE
MAYOR HOLSTEGE	AYE
MAYOR HERNANDEZ	AYE

MAYOR MATAS ABSENT
TRIBAL CHAIRMAN GRUBBE AYE
MAYOR EVANS AYE

6. **DISCUSSION**

6A. **CVAG Membership for Twenty-Nine Palms Band of Mission Indians – Tom Kirk**

Tom Kirk presented the staff report. Committee discussion ensued, with members noting how this would relate to the officer rotation.

IT WAS MOVED BY MAYOR EVANS AND SECONDED BY MAYOR HERNANDEZ TO APPROVE ADDENDUM NO. 2 TO THE THIRD AMENDMENT AND RESTATEMENT OF THE CVAG JOINT POWERS AGREEMENT, WHICH ESTABLISHES THE TWENTY-NINE PALMS BAND OF MISSION INDIANS AS A FORMAL MEMBER AND DIRECT THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO DISTRIBUTE TO MEMBER JURISDICTIONS FOR APPROVAL.

THE MOTION CARRIED WITH 5 AYES AND 1 MEMBER ABSENT.

COUNCILMEMBER MILLER AYE
MAYOR HOLSTEGE AYE
MAYOR HERNANDEZ AYE
MAYOR MATAS ABSENT
TRIBAL CHAIRMAN GRUBBE AYE
MAYOR EVANS AYE

6B. **CVAG Officer Rotation for FY 2021/2022 – Joanna Stueckle**

Mr. Kirk explained the officer rotation to the Administrative/Personnel Committee. Member discussion ensued regarding possibly revisiting officer rotation after redistricting takes place in California.

IT WAS MOVED BY MAYOR EVANS AND SECONDED BY TRIBAL CHAIR GRUBBE TO NOMINATE THE REPRESENTATIVE FROM THE CITY OF PALM SPRINGS TO SERVE AS FY 2021/2022 CHAIR AND THE REPRESENTATIVE FROM THE CITY OF COACHELLA TO SERVE AS FY 2021/2022 VICE CHAR.

THE MOTION CARRIED WITH 5 AYES AND 1 MEMBER ABSENT.

COUNCILMEMBER MILLER AYE
MAYOR HOLSTEGE AYE
MAYOR HERNANDEZ AYE
MAYOR MATAS ABSENT
TRIBAL CHAIRMAN GRUBBE AYE
MAYOR EVANS AYE

6C. **Update to CVAG's By-Laws – Joanna Stueckle**

Mr. Kirk presented the staff report, indicating that the recommended update reflects the addition of the new Tribal member jurisdictions as well as their position in the officer rotation schedule.

IT WAS MOVED BY MAYOR EVANS AND SECONDED BY TRIBAL CHAIR GRUBBE TO APPROVE AMENDMENTS TO THE CVAG BY-LAWS TO UPDATE THE ROTATION OF THE CVAG CHAIRMANSHIP AND REFLECT CURRENT MEMBERSHIP.

THE MOTION CARRIED WITH 5 AYES AND 1 MEMBER ABSENT.

COUNCILMEMBER MILLER	AYE
MAYOR HOLSTEGE	AYE
MAYOR HERNANDEZ	AYE
MAYOR MATAS	ABSENT
TRIBAL CHAIRMAN GRUBBE	AYE
MAYOR EVANS	AYE

6D. Meeting Reimbursements for Elected Committee Members – Claude T. Kilgore

Claude Kilgore presented the staff report. Brief member discussion ensued.

IT WAS MOVED BY MAYOR EVANS AND SECONDED BY TRIBAL CHAIR GRUBBE TO RENAME CVAG'S PER DIEM POLICY TO BE A STIPEND POLICY (NO. 21-03) AND SET THE STIPEND AMOUNT FOR MEETING ATTENDANCE AT \$125 FOR EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEMBERS AND AT \$100 FOR ALL OTHER COMMITTEES' ELECTED REPRESENTATIVES.

THE MOTION CARRIED WITH 5 AYES AND 1 MEMBER ABSENT.

COUNCILMEMBER MILLER	AYE
MAYOR HOLSTEGE	AYE
MAYOR HERNANDEZ	AYE
MAYOR MATAS	ABSENT
TRIBAL CHAIRMAN GRUBBE	AYE
MAYOR EVANS	AYE

6E. CLOSED SESSION

Public Employee Performance Evaluation

Government Code Section 54957(b)(1)

Title: Executive Director

Conference with Labor Negotiator

Government Code Section 54957.6

Agency's designated representative: Chair Glenn Miller and Vice Chair Christy Holstege

Unrepresented Employee: Executive Director

The Administrative/Personnel Committee adjourned to Closed Session at 9:25 a.m. and reconvened at 9:50 a.m. There was no reportable action taken.

7. PUBLIC COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

None.

8. **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Executive Committee – Monday, April 26, 2021 4:30 p.m. via Zoom videoconference

There being no further business, Chair Miller adjourned the meeting at 9:52 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Joanna Stueckle

Joanna Stueckle
Executive Assistant/Clerk

ITEM 5B

Coachella Valley Association of Governments
Administrative/ Personnel Committee
September 14, 2021



Staff Report

Subject: Authorization for Department of Justice background checks

Contact: Erica Felci, Assistant Executive Director (efelci@cvag.org)

Recommendation: Approve Resolution No. 21-006 authorizing the use of Department of Justice fingerprinting for employment in the CV Housing First program

Background: Prospective CVAG employees currently undergo a thorough background check, including a county criminal records review, as part of the hiring process. However, there are funding sources related to the CV Housing First program that require employees undergo a background check through the state and/or federal Departments of Justice, which involves electronically transmitted fingerprint images through Live Scan. Completion of this requirement is checked as part of the monitoring process that is conducted by the Riverside County Department of Housing, Homelessness Prevention and Workforce Solutions (HHPWS) Continuum of Care (CoC) Division.

Since bringing the CV Housing First program in-house in 2020, CVAG has been collaborating with the County of Riverside to get the background check completed for its staff. This was done prior to the March 2021 monitoring report. Moving forward, CVAG staff recommends that CVAG have authorization to request these background checks directly. The application for CVAG to use Live Scan requires an adopted resolution from the governing board, and a draft resolution is attached for the Committee's approval.

Fiscal Analysis: There was no cost to CVAG for the resolution.

Attachment: Resolution 21-006 to authorize additional background checks

**RESOLUTION NO. 21-006 OF THE COACHELLA VALLEY ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
AUTHORIZING THE USE OF DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE FINGERPRINTING FOR EMPLOYMENT**

WHEREAS, Penal Code Sections 11105(b)(11) and 13300(b)(11) authorize cities, counties, districts and joint powers authorities to access state and local summary criminal history information for employment, licensing or certification purposes; and

WHEREAS, Penal Code Section 11105(b)(11) authorizes cities, counties, districts and joint powers authorities to access federal level criminal history information by transmitting fingerprint images and related information to the Department of Justice to be transmitted to the Federal Bureau of Investigation; and

WHEREAS, Penal Code Sections 11105(b)(11) and 13300(b)(11) require that there be a requirement or exclusion from employment, licensing, or certification based on specific criminal conduct on the part of the subject of the record; and

WHEREAS, Penal Code Sections 11105(b)(11) and 13300(b)(11) require the city council, board of supervisors, governing body of a city, county or district or joint powers authority to specifically authorize access to summary criminal history information for employment, licensing, or certification purposes.

NOW THEREFORE THE COACHELLA VALLEY ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS HEREBY RESOLVES:

That CVAG is hereby authorized to access state and federal level summary criminal history information for employment (including volunteers and contract employees), licensing of positions within and supporting the CV Housing First program, or certification for positions within and supporting the CV Housing First program and may not disseminate the information to a private entity.

APPROVED AND ADOPTED on this 27th day of September, 2021.

Signed: _____ Date: _____
Christy Holstege, CVAG Chair
City of Palm Springs, Mayor

ATTEST: _____
Tom Kirk, CVAG Executive Director

ITEM 6A

Coachella Valley Association of Governments
Administrative/Personnel Committee
September 14, 2021



Staff Report

Subject: Virtual Committee Meetings at CVAG

Contact: Joanna Stueckle, Executive Assistant/Clerk (jstueckle@cvag.org)

Recommendation: Authorize the Chair and/or the Executive Director to advocate for Brown Act changes to allow regional agencies to continue utilizing virtual meetings, and continue to utilize virtual meetings consistent with state law and guidelines

Background: In March of 2020, CVAG, along with many of its members and sister agencies, began having committee meetings via video/ teleconferencing in place of in-person meetings due to the COVID-19 pandemic. It was determined that social distancing was an important factor in preventing the spread of COVID. This has proven to be an efficient way to conduct business for CVAG, which covers an expansive geographic area across eastern Riverside County. Committee meetings have been well attended, leading to thoughtful and robust conversations on CVAG's policies, projects and programs. The use of both videoconference and telephone access has also fostered public engagement, as people can join the meetings from a convenient location instead of driving to CVAG's Palm Desert conference room.

Now, more than 18 months later, California has "reopened" and no longer require the same level of social distancing. In May and June 2021, CVAG staff provided information to its committees that it would be seeking feedback from members on meeting formats that could be implemented this fiscal year, including exploring the options of continuing with at least some form of videoconferencing.

Three important factors should be considered when moving forward with the holding of in-person or virtual committee meetings: the results of the survey of CVAG members; the success of virtual meetings by way of committee member participation and the participation of members of the public; and the status of pending state legislation that could potentially change the Brown Act.

Survey Results and Success of Virtual Meetings

During the summer, staff sent an online survey to each member of the General Assembly, which is comprised of all five elected members from each CVAG jurisdiction, which at the time was 70 members. The survey asked several questions related to their experience with in-person meetings and with virtual meetings. CVAG also enlisted the assistance of Rick Bishop, retired Executive Director of the Western Riverside Council of Governments, to evaluate the results and provide insight to staff. Mr. Bishop was also involved in conducting an overall survey of statewide councils of governments for the California Association of Councils of Governments (CALCOG).

The survey of CVAG's members found 71% of the respondents support continuing with virtual meetings. CVAG's Executive Director received additional comments after the close of the survey by a handful of members who did not participate in the survey, but wanted to register their views related to how committee meetings should be held. For example, one of the Executive Committee members suggested all committee meetings, except for the Executive Committee, be conducted virtually. Another comment made suggested that all committee meetings be held virtually as virtual meetings were effective and well attended. Yet a third elected member indicated that she would not be able to attend any in-person meetings due to her current employment and would have to step down from her CVAG committees.

The CVAG survey showed 63% of participants indicated a strong or moderately strong preference in having hybrid meetings. In the short term, holding hybrid committee meetings would require CVAG use a meeting room at a separate, to-be-determined location due to the need of major upgrades to the CVAG meeting room, which does not have the audio/visual capabilities to host a hybrid meeting. There have also been concerns related to the size of CVAG's meeting room in Suite 119, which would limit the ability to socially distance both committee members and members of the public as a recommended means to prevent the spread of COVID-19. On average, CVAG committees are made up of 15 members and when the Executive Committee meets, staff anticipates up to 17 members attending, with many bringing along their managers, filling the meeting space with close to 30 members and staff. CVAG staff has started discussions on upgrading the conference room, and a project timeline and budget is still be developed.

CVAG's survey found only 15% of respondents expressed a strong or moderately strong desire to return to in-person meetings. Most participating members preferred virtual meetings, which is not surprising CVAG's online meetings are generally better attended than its in-person meetings. In fact, the last two CVAG General Assembly meetings – held in June 2020 and June 2021 – were among the highest member-attended General Assemblies in CVAG's history. During the pandemic, CVAG never had to reschedule a meeting due to lack of quorum and further CVAG has made it easier for members of members of the public to attend more meetings as they could do so from the comfort of their homes. Finally, because of the relative ease of coordinating virtual meetings, CVAG hosted four more meetings during FY 2020/2021, a full year of meetings during COVID, than it had in FY 2018/2019, the previous full year of in-person meetings. A summary of the attendance records for these meetings is attached.

Brown Act & Potential Legislative Changes

On March 17, 2020, Gov. Gavin Newsom issued Executive Order No. N-29-20, which suspended portions of the Brown Act that limit the use of teleconferencing for public meetings. Prior to the Executive Order, all locations where a member was participating via teleconference needed to be noticed and the public invited to each location. The Executive Order is set to expire on September 30, 2021.

There are several pieces of legislation that could potentially update the Brown Act continuing to allow some form of virtual meetings. According to Erin Sasse, the Regional Public Affairs Manager with the League of California Cities, it appears that the Governor's Administration prefers

legislative action instead of extending the Executive Order beyond the September sunset date. Several bills are moving through the legislature, and includes the following:

- AB 361 (Robert Rivas) creates an exemption to teleconferenced public meeting requirements for local legislative bodies during states of emergency. This means the public would continue to have access to the remote meetings and continue having the ability to make public comment. The same guidelines would apply as they have during the emergency order, meaning the agenda would need to be posted but it would not need to disclose all the remote locations from which members are participating. The bill includes an urgency clause, meaning it would take effect immediately after being signed by the Governor. The bill gained momentum in recent days, as the Senate Judiciary Committee voted for it and it now heads to the floor of both the Senate and Assembly. But it also requires a two-thirds vote in both chambers to move to the Governor's desk.
- AB 703 (Blanca Rubio) removes the Brown Act's notice requirements particular to teleconferencing and revises the requirements of the Brown Act to allow for teleconferencing subject to existing provisions regarding the posting of notice of an agenda, provided that the public is allowed to observe the meeting, address the legislative body directly (both in-person and remotely via a call or internet-based options) and that a quorum of members participate in person from a singular physical location in the jurisdiction that is clearly identified on the agenda and open to the public. AB 703 is pending before the Assembly Committee on Local Government.
- AB 339 (Lee/Garcia) would, until December 31, 2023, require all open and public meetings of a city council or a county board of supervisors that governs a jurisdiction containing least 250,000 people to include an opportunity for members of the public to attend via a two-way telephonic option or a two-way internet-based service options. It also would require a city council or county board of supervisors that has, as of June 15, 2021, provided video streaming, as defined, of at least one of its meetings to continue to provide that video streaming. The bill would require all open and public meetings to include an in-person public comment opportunity, except in specified circumstances during a declared state or local emergency. The bill would require all meetings to provide the public with an opportunity to comment on proposed legislation in person and remotely via a telephonic or an internet-based service option, as provided.

According to CALCOG Executive Director Bill Higgins, CALCOG will be taking an item to their September board meeting to discuss virtual meetings and potential legislative platforms that would allow for more favorable Brown Act updates for both the jurisdiction and members of the public. Regional governments cover a more expansive areas, have meetings that occur during the day, that often conflict with member schedules, and are focused on environmentally friendly ways to attend meetings.

Based on the pending legislation, conference room logistics and feedback from its members, CVAG staff is recommending that CVAG continue its virtual format for meetings as long as state law and guidelines allow. CVAG staff is also recommending the Chair and/or Executive Director be granted authority to advocate for legislation that would allow for regional agencies such as CVAG to continue relying on virtual formats permanently. CVAG has 19 member jurisdictions, so

it has a much larger committee membership than most agencies. Continued use of video conferencing also allows CVAG to help reduce vehicle miles traveled to its meetings, a practice that has demonstrated air quality and other environmental impacts in the last year.

Fiscal Analysis: There are no additional costs to CVAG hosting virtual meetings. Committee members are paid the same stipends as they would in person.

Attachments: Analysis of CVAG meeting attendance

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE			
FY 18/19		FY 20/21	
Jul-18	0	Jul-20	0
Aug-18	0	Aug-20	0
Sep-18	12	Sep-20	15
Oct-18	0	Oct-20	15
Nov-18	0	Nov-20	0
Dec-18	13	Dec-20	15
Jan-19	0	Jan-21	0
Feb-19	10	Feb-21	15
Mar-19	0	Mar-21	0
Apr-19	12	Apr-21	14
May-19	0	May-21	0
Jun-19	12	Jun-21	15
Jun-19	16	Jun-21	18
ATTENDEES	75	ATTENDEES	107
MEETINGS	6	MEETINGS	7
AVERAGE	12.50	AVERAGE	15.29

Special Joint Mtg w Trans

FY 20/21 vs FY18/19	
ATTENDEES	
DIFF #	DIFF %
2.79	22.29%

GENERAL ASSEMBLY			
FY 18/19		FY 20/21	
Jun-19	38	Jun-21	45
ATTENDEES	38	ATTENDEES	45
MEETINGS	1	MEETINGS	1
AVERAGE	38.00	AVERAGE	45.00

FY 20/21 vs FY18/19	
ATTENDEES	
DIFF #	DIFF %
7	18.42%

TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE			
FY 18/19		FY 20/21	
Jul-18	0	Jul-20	0
Aug-18	9	Aug-20	12
Sep-18	0	Sep-20	0
Oct-18	0	Oct-20	15
Nov-18	11	Nov-20	13
			12
Dec-18	0	Dec-20	0
Jan-19	0	Jan-21	0
Feb-19	0	Feb-21	10
Mar-19	0	Mar-21	0
Apr-19	9	Apr-21	10
May-19	11	May-21	0
Jun-19	12	Jun-21	12
ATTENDEES	52	ATTENDEES	84
MEETINGS	5	MEETINGS	7
AVERAGE	10.40	AVERAGE	12.00

Special Joint Mtg w Executive
11/2/2020
11/23/2020

FY 20/21 vs FY18/19	
ATTENDEES	
DIFF #	DIFF %
1.6	15.38%

HOMELESSNESS			
FY 18/19		FY 20/21	
Jul-18	0	Jul-20	12
Aug-18	0	Aug-20	11
Sep-18	11	Sep-20	10
Oct-18	0	Oct-20	0
Nov-18	0	Nov-20	11
Dec-18	0	Dec-20	0
Jan-19	10	Jan-21	0
Feb-19	11	Feb-21	11
Mar-19	0	Mar-21	0
Apr-19	11	Apr-21	12
May-19	8	May-21	13
Jun-19	9	Jun-21	0
ATTENDEES	60	ATTENDEES	80
MEETINGS	6	MEETINGS	7
AVERAGE	10.00	AVERAGE	11.43

FY 20/21 vs FY18/19	
ATTENDEES	
DIFF #	DIFF %
1.43	14.29%

PUBLIC SAFETY			
FY 18/19		FY 20/21	
Jul-18	0	Jul-20	0
Aug-18	0	Aug-20	0
Sep-18	9	Sep-20	7
Oct-18	0	Oct-20	0
Nov-18	10	Nov-20	10
Dec-18	0	Dec-20	0
Jan-19	9	Jan-21	0
Feb-19	9	Feb-21	10
Mar-19	0	Mar-21	0
Apr-19	0	Apr-21	0
May-19	10	May-21	8
Jun-19	9	Jun-21	8
ATTENDEES	56	ATTENDEES	43
MEETINGS	6	MEETINGS	5
AVERAGE	9.33	AVERAGE	8.60

FY 20/21 vs FY18/19	
ATTENDEES	
DIFF #	DIFF %
-0.73	-7.86%

CVCC			
FY 18/19		FY 20/21	
Jul-18	0	Jul-20	0
Aug-18	0	Aug-20	0
Sep-18	0	Sep-20	15
Oct-18	0	Oct-20	0
Nov-18	13	Nov-20	13
Dec-18	0	Dec-20	0
Jan-19	11	Jan-21	16
Feb-19	13	Feb-21	0
Mar-19	0	Mar-21	14
Apr-19	12	Apr-21	18
May-19	14	May-21	15
Jun-19	13	Jun-21	17
ATTENDEES	76	ATTENDEES	108
MEETINGS	6	MEETINGS	7
AVERAGE	12.67	AVERAGE	15.43

FY 20/21 vs FY18/19	
ATTENDEES	
DIFF #	DIFF %
2.76	21.80%

GRAND TOTAL			
FY 18/19		FY 20/21	
ATTENDEES	357	ATTENDEES	467
MEETINGS	30	MEETINGS	34
AVERAGE	11.9	AVERAGE	13.74

GRAND TOTAL	
FY 20/21 vs FY18/19	
ATTENDEES	
DIFF #	DIFF %
1.84	15.42%

ITEM 6B

Coachella Valley Association of Governments
Administrative/Personnel Committee
September 14, 2021



Staff Report

Subject: Review of CVAG Personnel Classifications and Compensation Structure

Contact: Claude T. Kilgore, Director of Finance/Administration (ckilgore@cvag.org) and Joanna Stueckle, Executive Assistant/Clerk (jstueckle@cvag.org)

Recommendation: Authorize the Executive Director to release a request for proposals for professional services related to assessing CVAG's current personnel classifications and compensation structure

Background: In its nearly 50 years of existence, CVAG has not utilized an external service provider to independently evaluate its employee classifications and the compensation offerings to CVAG staff. The last compensation survey was performed internally nearly 15 years ago and focused almost exclusively on the salary schedule.

The Executive Director has often said at CVAG meetings that he prefers hiring contractors over additional CVAG employees. However, CVAG is now the lead agency on several substantial regional projects, particularly in its transportation department. If there is additional funding at the state and federal levels for infrastructure, it could expand those duties. As such, CVAG staff anticipates a continued need to hire additional staff as existing employees are being given more and more responsibility, including the administrative support staff of such programs. At the same time, CVAG has in recent months experienced challenges in the recruiting of certain positions, with some openings only attracting two applicants. Even when looking at the job market on a macro level, CVAG is cognizant of a current shift in mentality which has moved the needle of employment leverage more towards that of the employee than seen before in recent years. This is further intensified by massive changes that the labor market has endured during the COVID-19 pandemic, with younger and newer workers bringing different expectations to the workplace than seen before.

Throughout her tenured history on the Administrative/Personnel Committee, La Quinta Mayor Linda Evans has often suggested a review of the current compensation system, particularly CVAG's current practice of having annual merit increases based on longevity within a position. Newly hired management – including this staff report's author -- also expressed an interest in assessing and updating CVAG's internal organizational structure to ensure that the right people are in the right seats and that those seats are matching appropriate job descriptions. Earlier this year, the CVAG Executive Director, under his signing authority, engaged the assistance of Rick Bishop, who has become a consultant for various agencies since his June retirement as Executive Director of the Western Riverside Council of Governments. Mr. Bishop's scope of services included an initial review of CVAG's staff organization and how those job descriptions relate to the programs and projects at CVAG, the Coachella Valley Conservation Commission (CVCC) and

Desert Community Energy (DCE). Mr. Bishop's assessment indicates a salary classification and compensation study would be beneficial for CVAG and the agencies it staffs.

The proposed analysis would involve re-evaluating the current personnel classification and compensation of its employees including salary ranges, hierarchy of classifications, benchmarking standards, job duties review, instances of potential pay compression, human resources maintenance systems, fringe benefits offered and the related issues. In doing such a comprehensive analysis, Staff seeks to ensure that all CVAG employees are accurately compensated and that CVAG is positioned in a competitive manner to attract and maintain top talent from both within and outside of the Coachella Valley.

CVAG staff is now seeking feedback on the proposal. Based on the direction, CVAG staff will issue a request for proposals and seek an independent expert to conduct a classification and salary analysis.

Fiscal Analysis: In this fiscal year, CVAG has budgeted more than \$3.5 million in personnel costs for salary and benefits.

The costs of a classification and salary analysis will be determined through a request for proposals, and any procurement of services and related contractual agreements will be presented for Executive Committee approval.

ITEM 6C

**Coachella Valley Association of Governments
Administrative/Personnel Committee
September 14, 2021**



Staff Report

Subject: Executive Director Performance Evaluation Procedure

Contact: Erica Felci, Assistant Executive Director (efelci@cvag.org)

Recommendation: Implement an annual performance review process for the Executive Director by the Administrative/ Personnel Committee

Background: The CVAG Executive Director also serves as the executive director for the Coachella Valley Conservation Commission (CVCC) and Desert Community Energy (DCE). Historically, the CVAG Executive Director has been evaluated about every two years. This practice pre-dates the current executive. The performance evaluation is conducted in a closed session meeting of the Administrative/ Personnel Committee and has, on occasion, led to a review of the executive director's contract. It is not uncommon for regional agencies to use survey tools as part executive's evaluation process.

The current Executive Director, Tom Kirk, was hired in 2008. In April 2021, the CVAG Administrative/ Personnel Committee conducted a performance evaluation that led to a contract amendment approved by the CVAG Executive Committee in June 2021. During this period, there was some discussion about the process of the evaluation process, and the Executive Committee and Executive Director agreed to add a clause to the 2021 contract amendment that the Administrative/ Personnel Committee conduct annual evaluations each spring. The Executive Director also agreed at the time to establish a more formal process for future reviews and is providing this staff report to detail a process the Committee can implement.

The Administrative/ Personnel Committee usually meets in March or April each year in order to discuss staffing issues as part of the budget preparation process. Under the new evaluation process, the CVAG Executive Director develop a survey that is sent to members of the Administrative/ Personnel Committee members in order to solicit feedback on various aspects of the Executive Director's performance. The purpose of the survey will be to assess the overall leadership performance; identify how well the Executive Director has implemented CVAG's current policies, programs and projects; and identify performance priorities for the coming year. This survey is likely to be distributed electronically, using a format such as SurveyMonkey. The Executive Director will fill out the survey as a self-evaluation, and it will be shared with the entire Administrative/ Personnel Committee for review and feedback. The self-evaluation will also include the Executive Director's goals and objectives for the coming year.

The exact survey questions are being finalized. But the survey will include categories such as management style; fiscal management of CVAG and various programs; and relationships with the Executive Committee, inter-governmental agencies and the general public. Questions could include:

- “Is the Executive Director effective in oral and written communications to ensure the Executive Committees and policy committee are kept informed on the status and progress of important issues and projects?”
- “Does the Executive Director implement and appropriate represent Executive Committee policies and actions to the community and the staff?”
- “Is there a strong and effective management team and does it work well in a spirit of cooperation?” and
- “Are CVAG’s fiscal policies well implemented and understanding, including keep the Executive Committee informed on the status of the agency’s financial condition?”

The survey results will be provided to the Chair and/or a designee to be compiled prior to the Administrative/ Personnel Committee meeting in closed session for the annual review.

Fiscal Analysis: There are no additional costs to this information item.