

**Coachella Valley Conservation Commission**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**February 8, 2018**



The audio file for this committee can be found at: <http://www.cvag.org/minutes.htm>

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting of the Coachella Valley Conservation Commission (CVCC) was called to order at 11:01 am by Mayor Pro Tem Kite. Arriving after roll call, Chair Michael Wilson presided over the meeting.

**2. ROLL CALL**

Roll call was taken and it was determined that a quorum was present.

**Members Present**

Councilmember Mark Carnevale  
 Councilmember Emmanuel Martinez \*\*  
 Councilmember Anayeli Zavala  
 Mayor Michael Wilson, Chair \*  
 Councilmember Susan Marie Weber  
 Councilmember Lisa Middleton  
 Mayor Pro Tem Richard W. Kite  
 Councilmember Jan Harnik  
 (Alternate for Supervisor Chuck Washington)  
 Mayor Steven Hernandez  
 (Alternate for Supervisor Marion Ashley)  
 Board Member Anthony Bianco  
 Board Member Juanita Salas \*\*  
 (via teleconference)

**Agency**

City of Cathedral City  
 City of Coachella  
 City of Desert Hot Springs  
 City of Indio  
 City of Palm Desert  
 City of Palm Springs  
 City of Rancho Mirage  
 Riverside County – 3<sup>rd</sup> District  
  
 Riverside County, 5<sup>th</sup> District  
  
 Coachella Valley Water District  
 Imperial Irrigation District

*[\*Members who arrived after the Call to Order. \*\*Members who arrived later to the meeting.]*

**Members Absent**

Councilmember Dana Reed  
 Mayor Linda Evans, Vice Chair  
 Councilmember Glenn Miller  
 (Alternate for Supervisor Kevin Jeffries)  
 Councilmember Geoff Kors  
 (Alternate for Supervisor John Tavaglione)  
 Supervisor V. Manuel Perez  
 Board Member Nancy Wright

City of Indian Wells  
 City of La Quinta  
 Riverside County - 1<sup>st</sup> District  
  
 Riverside County - 2<sup>nd</sup> District  
  
 Riverside County - 4<sup>th</sup> District  
 Mission Springs Water District

**Others Present**

Ryan Domino  
 Chris Clarke  
 Britt Wilson  
 Jim Karpiak

LSL, CPAs  
 National Parks Cons. Assoc.  
 City of Rancho Mirage  
 Coachella Valley Mountains  
 Conservancy

Chris Gregory  
Noelle Ronan  
Heather Pert  
Kathy Longshore  
Joan Taylor  
Doug Evans  
Kim Floyd

USFWS – Palm Springs  
USFWS – Palm Springs  
CDFW  
USGS  
Sierra Club  
Desert Trails Coalition  
Resident

CVAG Staff

Tom Kirk  
Katie Barrows  
Jim Sullivan  
Kathleen Brundige  
Linda Rogers

**3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

Mayor Pro Tem Kite led in the Pledge of Allegiance.

**4. PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Chris Clarke with the National Parks Conservation Association and Joan Taylor representing the Sierra Club were present and addressed their comments under No. 7E.

**5. COMMITTEE MEMBER / DIRECTOR COMMENTS**

Mr. Kirk suggested moving Item 7E forward on the agenda since there are two members of the public that would like to make public comments regarding that item.

**6. CONSENT CALENDAR**

**IT WAS MOVED BY MAYOR PRO TEM KITE, SECONDED BY MAYOR HERNANDEZ, TO:**

- A. Approve the Minutes of the October 12, 2017 Coachella Valley Conservation Commission**
- B. Adopt Policy 18-01, authorizing the Executive Director to accept Caltrans mitigation payments in any amount**

**THE MOTION CARRIED WITH 7 AYES ON 6A AND 2 ABSTENTIONS ON 6A; AND 9 AYES ON 6B; 8 ABSENT.**

Councilmember Mark Carnevale	Abstain 6A; Aye 6B
Councilmember Emmanuel Martinez *	Absent for Vote
Councilmember Anayeli Zavala	Aye
Mayor Michael Wilson, Chair	Aye
Councilmember Susan Marie Weber	Aye
Councilmember Lisa Middleton	Abstain 6A; Aye 6B
Mayor Pro Tem Richard W. Kite	Aye
Councilmember Jan Harnik	Aye
(Alternate for Supervisor Chuck Washington)	
Mayor Steven Hernandez	Aye
(Alternate for Supervisor Marion Ashley)	

Board Member Anthony Bianco	Aye
Board Member Juanita Salas **	Absent for Vote
Councilmember Dana Reed	Absent
Mayor Linda Evans, Vice Chair	Absent
Councilmember Glenn Miller (Alternate for Supervisor Kevin Jeffries)	Absent
Councilmember Geoff Kors (Alternate for Supervisor John Tavaglione)	Absent
Supervisor V. Manuel Perez	Absent
Board Member Nancy Wright	Absent

*[\*Councilmember Martinez is now present. \*\*Board Member Juanita Salas is now participating in the meeting by way of teleconference. Chair Wilson introduced and welcomed Ms. Salas as the newly appointed IID representative to the CVCC].*

## **7. DISCUSSION / ACTION**

### **A. Audited Financial Report and Statement on Auditing Standards (SAS) 114 Letter for Fiscal Year 2016/17**

Tom Kirk provided a brief overview of the audited financial report and statement. The CVCC Finance Committee met and reviewed the report with the CVCC auditor Lance, Soll & Lunghard (LSL). Mr. Ryan Domino with LSL was present and provided an overview of the audited financial report and statement.

**IT WAS MOVED BY COUNCILMEMBER HARNIK, SECONDED BY COUNCILMEMBER MIDDLETON, TO RECEIVE AND FILE THE REPORTS FOR FISCAL YEAR 2016/17.**

**THE MOTION CARRIED WITH 11 AYES; 6 ABSENT.**

Councilmember Mark Carnevale	AYE
Councilmember Emmanuel Martinez	AYE
Councilmember Anayeli Zavala	AYE
Mayor Michael Wilson, Chair	AYE
Councilmember Susan Marie Weber	AYE
Councilmember Lisa Middleton	AYE
Mayor Pro Tem Richard W. Kite	AYE
Councilmember Jan Harnik (Alternate for Supervisor Chuck Washington)	AYE
Mayor Steven Hernandez (Alternate for Supervisor Marion Ashley)	AYE
Board Member Anthony Bianco	AYE
Board Member Juanita Salas (teleconferencing)	AYE
Councilmember Dana Reed	ABSENT
Mayor Linda Evans, Vice Chair	ABSENT
Councilmember Glenn Miller (Alternate for Supervisor Kevin Jeffries)	ABSENT
Councilmember Geoff Kors (Alternate for Supervisor John Tavaglione)	ABSENT
Supervisor V. Manuel Perez	ABSENT
Board Member Nancy Wright	ABSENT

**B. Fiscal Year 2016/17 Report on Local Development Mitigation Fee**

**IT WAS MOVED BY COUNCILMEMBER HARNIK, SECONDED BY COUNCILMEMBER ZAVALA, TO ACCEPT THE LOCAL DEVELOPMENT MITIGATION FEE ANNUAL AND FIVE-YEAR REPORT FOR FISCAL YEAR 2016/2017 IN FULFILLMENT OF THE REPORTING REQUIREMENTS OF THE MITIGATION FEE ACT.**

**THE MOTION CARRIED WITH 11 AYES; 6 ABSENT.**

Councilmember Mark Carnevale	AYE
Councilmember Emmanuel Martinez	AYE
Councilmember Anayeli Zavala	AYE
Mayor Michael Wilson, Chair	AYE
Councilmember Susan Marie Weber	AYE
Councilmember Lisa Middleton	AYE
Mayor Pro Tem Richard W. Kite	AYE
Councilmember Jan Harnik	AYE
(Alternate for Supervisor Chuck Washington)	
Mayor Steven Hernandez	AYE
(Alternate for Supervisor Marion Ashley)	
Board Member Anthony Bianco	AYE
Board Member Juanita Salas	AYE
(teleconferencing)	
Councilmember Dana Reed	ABSENT
Mayor Linda Evans, Vice Chair	ABSENT
Councilmember Glenn Miller	ABSENT
(Alternate for Supervisor Kevin Jeffries)	
Councilmember Geoff Kors	ABSENT
(Alternate for Supervisor John Tavaglione)	
Supervisor V. Manuel Perez	ABSENT
Board Member Nancy Wright	ABSENT

**C. Acceptance of CDFW Local Assistance Grant Funds for Peninsular Bighorn Sheep and Human Recreational Activity Study**

**IT WAS MOVED BY MAYOR PRO TEM KITE, SECONDED BY COUNCILMEMBER MIDDLETON, TO APPROVE RESOLUTION 18-001, ACCEPTING A LOCAL ASSISTANCE GRANT FROM THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF FISH AND WILDLIFE IN THE AMOUNT OF \$94,250 FOR DETERMINING HABITAT USE AND RESPONSE TO HUMAN RECREATIONAL ACTIVITIES OF PENINSULAR BIGHORN SHEEP (*Ovis canadensis nelsoni*) IN A SHARED LANDSCAPE.**

**THE MOTION CARRIED WITH 11 AYES; 6 ABSENT.**

Councilmember Mark Carnevale	AYE
Councilmember Emmanuel Martinez	AYE
Councilmember Anayeli Zavala	AYE
Mayor Michael Wilson, Chair	AYE
Councilmember Susan Marie Weber	AYE
Councilmember Lisa Middleton	AYE
Mayor Pro Tem Richard W. Kite	AYE

Councilmember Jan Harnik (Alternate for Supervisor Chuck Washington)	AYE
Mayor Steven Hernandez (Alternate for Supervisor Marion Ashley)	AYE
Board Member Anthony Bianco	AYE
Board Member Juanita Salas (teleconferencing)	AYE
Councilmember Dana Reed	ABSENT
Mayor Linda Evans, Vice Chair	ABSENT
Councilmember Glenn Miller (Alternate for Supervisor Kevin Jeffries)	ABSENT
Councilmember Geoff Kors (Alternate for Supervisor John Tavaglione)	ABSENT
Supervisor V. Manuel Perez	ABSENT
Board Member Nancy Wright	ABSENT

**D. Update on Peninsular Bighorn Sheep Fence**

Katie Barrows provided an update on the status of the La Quinta Peninsular Bighorn Sheep Barrier Project. Coordination with property owners and work on the environmental documents continues.

**E. Release of Draft EIR for the Paradise Valley Specific Plan**

Katie Barrows provided information on the Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR) for the Paradise Valley Specific Plan. A comment letter from the Center for Biological Diversity was distributed to CVCC members. Councilmember Harnik added before giving consideration to this, she would like time to study it.

Public Comments:

Joan Taylor stated that the Sierra Club has reviewed the letter from the Center for Biological Diversity and concurs with their comments. The Sierra Club also reviewed a letter addressed to Riverside County Supervisor John Benoit dating back to January 2016 (a copy of said letter was given to the recording clerk). Ms. Taylor strongly urged that a joint project review be done.

Chris Clarke with the National Parks Conservation Association addressed the CVCC strongly opposing the Paradise Valley project listing his chief concerns. Mr. Clarke also reiterated the need for a joint project review.

**8. INFORMATION**

- 1) CVCC's Quarterly Unaudited Financial Statements as at Dec. 31, 2017
- 2) CVCC's Investment Report as at Dec. 31, 2017
- 3) CVCC Attendance Roster
- 4) Contracts under \$25,000

9. **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Next scheduled meeting at 73-710 Fred Waring Drive, Room 119, Palm Desert:

**Coachella Valley Conservation Commission – Thursday, April 12, 2018, 11:00 a.m.**

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 11:50 am.

Respectfully submitted,

Linda Rogers  
Program Assistant II