

**SPECIAL EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE
MINUTES OF MEETING
MAY 15, 2017**



The audio file for this committee meeting can be found at: <http://www.cvag.org/audio.htm>

1. CALL TO ORDER

The May 15, 2017 Special Executive Committee meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Chair Dana Reed, City of Indian Wells, at Palm Desert Council Chamber, City Hall, in Palm Desert.

2. ROLL CALL

A roll call was taken and it was determined that a quorum was present. Those in attendance were as follows:

MEMBERS PRESENT

- Mayor Joseph DeConinck
- Mayor Stan Henry
- Mayor Steven Hernandez
- Mayor Scott Matas
- Councilmember Dana Reed
- Mayor Pro Tem Mike Wilson
- Mayor Linda Evans
- Mayor Jan Harnik
- Mayor Robert Moon
- Councilmember Dana Hobart
- Supervisor V. Manuel Perez
- Chief of Staff Jaime Hurtado

AGENCY

- City of Blythe
- City of Cathedral City
- City of Coachella
- City of Desert Hot Springs
- City of Indian Wells
- City of Indio
- City of La Quinta
- City of Palm Desert
- City of Palm Springs
- City of Rancho Mirage
- County of Riverside 4th District
- County of Riverside 5th District

MEMBERS NOT PRESENT

- Supervisor Kevin Jeffries
- Supervisor John Tavaglione
- Supervisor Chuck Washington
- Tribal Chair Jeff Grubbe
- Tribal Chair Douglas Welmas

AGENCY

- County of Riverside 1st District
- County of Riverside 2nd District
- County of Riverside 3rd District
- Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians
- Cabazon Band of Mission Indians

NON-VOTING MEMBERS PRESENT

- Peter Cosentini
- Pat Milos
- Bill Pattison
- Luke Rainey
- Dan Martinez

AGENCY

- City of Blythe
- City of Cathedral City
- City of Coachella
- City of Desert Hot Springs
- City of Indio

Frank Spevacek
Lauri Aylaian
David Ready
Randy Bynder
Brian Nestande
Tom Davis

City of La Quinta
City of Palm Desert
City of Palm Springs
City of Rancho Mirage
County of Riverside
Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians

OTHERS PRESENT

John Anselm
Anthony Alvarez
M. Arcoli Areaol
Rosario Avila
Ken Battle
Joanna Belaños
Rick Berg
Robert Brassfield
Tom Burks
Jennifer Calleros
Livi Calleros
Wendy Campbell
Cindy Cole
Kevin Cole
Leticia Collins
Austin Coulter
Steve Coulter
Deiter Crawford
C. Cross
Nancy DeLuna
Amanda Dorta
Patrick Dugan
Kathleen Emerson
Mack Emerson
Carol Faselli
Jean Fidelgo
Vic Gainer
David Gassaway
Douglas Goldfarb
Paula Goldfarb
Chris Gregory
James Griswold
Esperanza Guzman
Allan Haeberle
Vicki Haeberle
Isaiah Hagerman
Dr. Chris Hancock
Bob Hargreaves
Hasan Ikhata
Monica Hayes
Betsie Hewitt
Les Hewitt
Andrew Hirsch

AGENCY

Desert Recreation District

Cathedral City Resident
Palm Desert Resident
Cathedral City Resident
Palm Springs Resident
Rancho Mirage Resident

Cathedral City Resident
Cathedral City Resident
La Quinta Resident
Rancho Mirage Resident
Rancho Mirage Resident
Friends of CV Link
Desert Critical Mass
Palm Desert Resident
Palm Springs Resident
Palm Desert Cycling

Palm Desert Resident
Rancho Mirage
Palm Desert Resident
Palm Desert Resident
Palm Desert Resident
Rancho Mirage Resident
Friends of CV Link
City of Indian Wells
Rancho Mirage Resident
Rancho Mirage Resident
US Fish and Wildlife Service
Rancho Mirage Resident
Lideres Campesinas
La Quinta Resident
La Quinta Resident
City of Rancho Mirage
Desert Doctors
Cathedral City Resident
Southern California Association of Governments
Palm Desert Resident
Palm Desert Resident
Palm Desert Resident
Palm Springs Resident

Clapa Hopkins
Tom Horne
Beverly Iron
Dr. Katrina John
Sarah Johnson
Neil Johnson
Mayor Pro Tem Sabby Jonathan
Wendy Jonathan
Louise Kermode
Emily Kincaid
Hilton Kincaid
Mayor Pro Tem Richard Kite
Thomas Kohn
David La Porta
Max Lara
Patricia Leal
Alec Longmuir
Gary Lueders
Nathan Mach
Mariela Magaña
Jenness McBride
Scott McKelvey
Lisa Middleton
Angela Miller
Jeff Miller
Jim Miringoff
Councilmember Gina Nestande
Anna Nevenic
Marvin Norman
Bryan Newman
David O'Donnell
Arvin Ocampo
Diane Oliver
Pam Orr
Richard Orr
Gerald Pease
Christina Peña
Mindy Reed
Murray Quance
Paul Quill
Manuel Ramirez
Mariel Ramirez
Yesenea Ramos
Daniel Recklah
Naran Reitman
Henry Rice
John Ritter
Rodnee Ritter
Linda Rivest
Randy Roberts
Jay Rockbank

Friends of CV Link
Rancho Mirage Resident

Indian Wells Resident

Palm Desert Resident
City of Palm Desert
Desert Sands Unified School District
Palm Desert Resident
Friends of CV Link
Friends of CV Link
City of Rancho Mirage
Friends of CV Link
Rancho Mirage Resident
Desert Critical Mass
Leadership Counsel

Friends of CV Link
Salton Sea Triatholon
Leadership Counsel
Cathedral City Resident
Palm Desert Resident
Palm Springs Resident
Rancho Mirage Resident
Rancho Mirage Resident
Palm Desert Resident
City of Palm Desert
Palm Springs Resident
Inland Empire Biking Alliance
Pedego Electric Bikes

Desert Critical Mass
Palm Desert Resident
Cathedral City Resident
Cathedral City Resident
Pease Chiropractic
Palm Desert Resident
Palm Springs Resident
CVAG Volunteer
La Quinta Resident
Lideres Campesinas
Lideres Campesinas
Lideres Campesinas

Palm Desert Chamber
La Quinta Resident
Cathedral City Resident
Cathedral City Resident
Palm Desert Resident
Palm Desert Resident
Palm Desert Resident

Noelle Roman
Rich Ronzella
Rany Rotseah
Jim Rothblatt
Manuel Salas
Councilmember Steve Sanchez
Ed Schiller
T. Scott
Laren Segara
Mary Settle
Michael Shovlin
Steven Sims
Councilmember Iris Smotrich
Dr. Christopher Snyah
Cheryl Stark
John Stark
Ryan Stendell
Leo Sullivan
Mary Lou Suter
Bob Terry
Shana Tooley
Bane Tolseas
Brian Torsnoi
Evan Trubee
Nguyer T.Q. Van
Debra Vogler
John Vogler
Joyce Virture
Barry Williams
Rocky Wood
Gary Wright
Brian Yaklich
Victor Yepello Palm Springs Bike Coalition

Cathedral City Resident

Palm Desert Resident
Friends of CV Link
Indio Resident
City of La Quinta
Friends of CV Link
Palm Desert Resident

Coachella Valley Hiking Club
La Quinta Resident
Go Bike USA
City of Rancho Mirage

Palm Desert Resident
Palm Desert Resident
City of Palm Desert
Cathedral City Resident
Rancho Mirage Resident
People Over Pollution

Palm Desert Resident
Palm Desert Resident
Big Wheel Tours

Rancho Mirage Resident

Bike Palm Springs
Palm Desert Resident
Palm Springs Resident

STAFF PRESENT

Tom Kirk
Gary Leong
Martin Magaña
Katie Barrows
Jim Sullivan
LeGrand Velez
Cheryll Dahlin
Erica Felci
Lance Albrecht
Joanna Stueckle
Toni Eggebraaten

CVAG Legal Counsel

3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Executive Assistant Joanna Stueckle led the Executive Committee in the Pledge of Allegiance.

4. EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE / DIRECTOR COMMENTS

In the interest of time, Chair Reed moved this item to follow Item 6 – Public Comments without objection.

5. CERTIFICATION OF THE CV LINK FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT AND APPROVAL OF PROJECT – LeGrand Velez

Tom Kirk thanked the City of Palm Desert for the use of the Council Chamber and proceeded to explain the process of the public meeting to consider the certification of the CV Link Environmental Impact Report (EIR). Mr. Kirk introduced LeGrand Velez.

Mr. Velez presented the staff report, including the presentation of project history.

It was pointed out that Spanish translation services are available. Public testimony began at 6:25 p.m. The following public testimony was received:

Hasan Ikhata, SCAG Executive Director, expressed strong support for the CV Link project by SCAG and the SCAG Regional Council, made up of 109 city representatives.

David Gassaway, City of Indian Wells, spoke on behalf of the City of Indian Wells. Mr. Gassaway indicated the City believes their comments have not been addressed.

Vic Gainer, Friends of CV Link, spoke in support of the project for a variety of reasons including the CV Link being an attraction that will bring people to the Coachella Valley and a way to address the improvement of health.

Anna Nevenic, Palm Springs resident, expressed opposition to the project, indicating that she believed few people would use the path and that the Coachella Valley should focus on a rail system.

Victor Yepello, Palm Springs Bike Coalition and Coachella Valley Bicycle Coalition, spoke in favor of the project indicating that the CV Link will save lives as it provides safety to its users.

Randy Roberts, Palm Desert resident, spoke in opposition to the project for a variety of reasons, including his belief that it would be dangerous to have Neighborhood Electric Vehicles (NEVs) sharing the path with pedestrians.

Leticia Collins, spoke in favor of the project, indicating that she saw no downside to the project and that the CV Link provided a safe place for those with physical disabilities.

Gary Lueders, Friends of CV Link, spoke in support of the project for safety reasons and cited statistics involving cycling deaths in the Coachella Valley.

Louise Kermode, Palm Desert Resident, expressed opposition to the project, discussing operations and maintenance costs (O&M) and indicated that she supported Palm Desert allowing the issue to go to the voters.

Scott McKelvey, Palm Desert resident, spoke in favor of the CV Link and indicated compromises were made in planning the project and that, though there wasn't unanimous support, there was clear majority support.

Jim Rothblatt, Friends of CV Link, welcomed newly appointed Supervisor V. Manuel Perez and discussed his many years of cycling in the Coachella Valley. Mr. Rothblatt encouraged CVAG to keep up the good work.

Allan Haeberle, La Quinta resident, spoke in support of the project, and asked that call boxes be considered to access emergency services.

Cheryl Stark, Palm Desert resident, expressed her opposition to the project and encouraged the City of Palm Desert vote on the project.

Lisa Middleton, Palm Springs resident, spoke in support of the project, indicating this was a public safety issue, stressing the inequality of a matchup between cyclist and a car on roads.

Jack Ritter, Palm Desert resident, opposed the project due to NEVs and pedestrians sharing the pathway.

Andrew Hirsch, Palm Springs resident, opposed the project and questioned air quality claims.

Bob Terry, People Over Pollution, spoke in opposition of the project, adding that the project would be approved despite the opposition.

Joyce Virture, Rancho Mirage resident, spoke in opposition of the project and encouraged a Coachella Valley vote on CV Link.

Naran Reitman, Palm Desert Chamber, spoke in support of the CV Link, indicating that the Jefferson Street project wasn't put to a vote and encouraged the Executive Committee to approve the EIR.

Mary Lou Suter, Rancho Mirage resident, supported the CV Link project going to the voters and stated that she did not support the use of Measure A for the project.

Mary Settle, Coachella Valley Hiking Club, encouraged support of the EIR and discussed her use of trails around the world, adding that the CV Link was safe and effective.

Rocky Wood, Bike Palm Springs, spoke in favor of the project and it's potential to attract tourists to the Coachella Valley.

Jim Miringoff, spoke in support of Palm Desert allowing a vote to consider the CV Link.

Linda Rivest, Palm Desert resident, indicated that she was 100% in favor of the CV Link.

James Griswold, Rancho Mirage resident, spoke in favor of CV Link, stating that the project will encourage more people to get active, while increasing tourism in the Coachella Valley.

Dr. Chris Hancock, Desert Doctors, indicated that the CV Link is a public service project that will increase a healthier lifestyle and encouraged a positive vote from members.

Tom Horne, Rancho Mirage resident, spoke in favor of the project, expressing his disappointment in his Council and encouraged members to think beyond themselves.

Debra Vogler, Palm Desert resident, indicated the CV Link was a nice project and discussed a project in another community.

Hilton Kincaid, Friends of CV Link and La Quinta resident, spoke in favor of the project for safety reasons and looks forward to his wife being able to ride on the project safely.

Jeff Miller, Rancho Mirage resident, opposed the project, stating that the bigger health issue is the Salton Sea and said that the CV Link will cost too much money.

Paul Quill, La Quinta resident, spoke in favor of the project, adding that he agreed completely with statements made by supporters and stressed the positive impact on health.

Rosario Avila, Cathedral City resident, opposed the CV Link, stating approval of the EIR was a disservice to the community.

Douglas Goldfarb, Rancho Mirage resident, spoke in support of the project, indicating that the CV Link will improve business in the Coachella Valley.

Rick Berg, Palm Springs resident opposed the project, suggesting CV Link funding could be spent elsewhere.

David La Porta, Rancho Mirage resident, spoke in support of the project and disagreed with the decisions made by Rancho Mirage and Indian Wells to not participate.

Evan Trubee, Big Wheel Tours, spoke in support of the CV Link and indicated that he has seen tremendous growth in tourism, adding that you can't go wrong with adding to the infrastructure of the Coachella Valley.

Mariela Magaña, Leadership Counsel, spoke in opposition of the project, indicating that this was a tourism project that didn't consider the workforce of the tourism industry and asked members to take a closer look at maintenance.

Thomas Kohn, Friends of CV Link, thanked the Executive Committee for the opportunity to discuss the project and urged members move forward with the CV Link.

Patricia Leal, Leadership Counsel, spoke in opposition of the project, indicating that areas of the east valley do not benefit from the CV Link.

Deiter Crawford, Palm Springs resident, supported the CV Link and discussed ways it will benefit the Coachella Valley.

Brian Torsnoi, Palm Desert resident, encouraged a vote of the residents.

Amanda Dorta, Palm Desert resident, spoke in favor of the project, expressing her excitement in the approval of the CV Link as it will stimulate the Coachella Valley's economy.

Nathan Mach, Salton Sea Triathlon Club, spoke in support of the project, suggesting there would be many benefits because of the CV Link.

Austin Coulter, Desert Critical Mass, spoke in support of the CV Link, adding that as a cyclist, it would be much safer to stay off of Highway 111 and Fred Waring Drive.

Max Lara, Desert Critical Mass, spoke in favor of the project due to the safety aspects of CV Link.

Manuel Salas, Indio resident, spoke in support of the project, adding that it will encourage a safe pedestrian option.

Arvin Ocampo, Desert Critical Mass, spoke in support of the CV Link indicating that the path would make it possible to travel through the valley safely and without a car.

Brian Yaklich, Palm Springs resident, spoke in support of the project indicating that the CV link will encourage the coming together of people as a community and revitalize the community.

Robert Brassfield, Rancho Mirage resident, thanked the Executive Committee for the forum, adding that he supported the CV Link as it encouraged a culture of wellness.

Steven Sims, Go Bike USA, stated that cyclists needed a break from the monotony and ways to ride safely into neighborhoods.

Kevin Cole, Rancho Mirage resident, encouraged the Executive Committee to not miss this great opportunity and approve the CV Link.

Dr. Katrina John, Indian Wells resident, spoke in support of the CV Link, adding that though she had cycled in many areas of the world, she feared riding her bike in the Coachella Valley and discussed many benefits of the project.

Bryan Newman, Pedego Electric Bikes, spoke in support of CV Link and indicated that it will meet the needs of many different groups.

Marven Norman, Inland Empire Biking Alliance, spoke in favor of the CV Link and encouraged CVAG to start phase 2 and work on the connectivity.

Mindy Reed, Palm Springs resident, thanked the Executive Committee members for the meeting and the Palm Springs City Council for voting to support CV Link. Ms. Reed supports the project and discussed safety aspects of the project.

Wendy Jonathan, Desert Sands Unified School District (DSUSD), was called to the podium. Ms. Jonathan was unable to stay to give comments, however turned in her speaker card with her comments on it. Chair Reed read her statement which indicated DSUSD support of CV Link and indicated the Board sent a letter of support to CVAG.

Christina Peña, Palm Desert resident, spoke in support of the project as it will make cycling safer.

Public testimony closed at 8:05 p.m. A ten-minute break was taken.

The Executive Committee reconvened at 8:15 p.m. Chair Reed invited Mr. Velez to the podium to give staff's response.

Mr. Velez gave a report on the number of responses CVAG received and included with the staff report, including the letter CVAG received just prior to the public meeting from the City of Rancho Mirage.

Mr. Velez introduced the team working on the CV Link EIR, which included John Criste and Nicole Criste, Terra Nova Planning and Research; Deven Young, Alta Planning and Design; and Charity Schiller, Best, Best & Krieger (BB&K).

Members of the team presented their individual responses to questions not included in the EIR response. Executive Committee member discussion ensued.

Marcus Fuller, City of Palm Springs, requested the Executive Committee members consider a City of Palm Springs' request for an amendment to the staff recommended motion to include the alignment variations on both the east and west sides of North Palm Canyon Drive.

Mr. Kirk requested that the proposed City of Palm Springs amendment be conditional upon identification of outside funding for the bridge (associated with the west side alignment).

IT WAS MOVED BY MAYOR PRO TEM WILSON AND SECONDED BY MAYOR EVANS TO APPROVE THE FOLLOWING AS AMENDED:

- 1) **ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION 17-003 CERTIFYING THE FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT (SCH #2013111050) FOR THE CV LINK PROJECT; ADOPTING ENVIRONMENTAL FINDINGS PURSUANT TO THE CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT; AND ADOPTING A MITIGATION MONITORING AND REPORTING PROGRAM.**
- 2) **ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION 17-004 APPROVING CV LINK ALTERNATIVE 1, AS MODIFIED, INCLUDING THE WEST SIDE ALIGNMENT ON NORTH PALM CANYON DRIVE CONTINGENT UPON OUTSIDE FUNDING FOR THE BRIDGE OVER HIGHWAY 111 AT CHINO WASH; AND ADOPTING A STATEMENT OF OVERRIDING CONSIDERATIONS.**

THE MOTION CARRIED WITH 10 AYES, 1 NAY, 1 ABSTAINSTION AND 5 MEMBERS ABSENT.

MAYOR DECONINCK	AYE
MAYOR HENRY	AYE
MAYOR HERNANDEZ	AYE
MAYOR MATAS	AYE

COUNCILMEMBER REED	ABSTAIN
MAYOR PRO TEM WILSON	AYE
MAYOR EVANS	AYE
MAYOR HARNIK	AYE
MAYOR MOON	AYE
COUNCILMEMBER HOBART	NAY
SUPERVISOR JEFFRIES	ABSENT
SUPERVISOR TAVAGLIONE	ABSENT
SUPERVISOR WASHINGTON	ABSENT
SUPERVISOR PEREZ	AYE
CHIEF OF STAFF HURTADO	AYE
TRIBAL CHAIR GRUBBE	ABSENT
TRIBAL CHAIR WELMAS	ABSENT

6. **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

None.

4. **EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE / DIRECTOR COMMENTS**

None.

7. **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Upcoming Meetings at 73-710 Fred Waring Drive, Suite 119, Palm Desert:

Technical Advisory Committee – Monday, June 12, 2017 at 11:00 a.m.

Executive Committee– Monday, June 5, 2017 at 4:30 p.m.

Upcoming Meeting of General Assembly:

General Assembly – Monday, June 26, 2017 at 6:00 p.m. at Miramonte Resort & Spa,
45000 Indian Wells Lane, Indian Wells

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, Chair Reed adjourned the meeting at 9:32 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Joanna Stueckle

Joanna Stueckle
Executive Assistant